Active Living Research

Building Evidence to Prevent Childhood Obesity and Support Active Communities **www.activelivingresearch.org**

May 2012

RESEARCH BRIEF

Policies and Standards for Promoting Physical Activity in After-School Programs

Introduction

Today, nearly one in three young people in the United States are overweight or obese and lack of physical activity contributes to the epidemic.¹ Regular physical activity promotes health, reduces risk for obesity and has been shown to improve students' academic performance.^{2,3} Leading public health officials recognize after-school programs as an important setting for promoting physical activity and preventing obesity.^{4–7} Nationwide, more than 8 million children and adolescents spend an average of eight hours per week in after-school programs.⁸

In recent years, 14 states have adopted policies and national standards have been developed to help increase the amount of physical activity children accumulate while attending after-school programs.⁹ In April 2011, the National Afterschool Association released physical activity standards for after-school programs and summer camps, but many of the existing standards and policies lack clearly defined benchmarks.¹⁰ Since many of the policy goals are difficult to



measure, leaders and staff at after-school programs, as well as state and national organizations, are not able to monitor compliance with the policies or evaluate their effectiveness. There also are substantial differences in staffing and resources, such as indoor and outdoor play space, among after-school programs,^{6,7} which should be considered as policies and standards are developed.

This brief summarizes research on physical activity in after-school programs and examines how policies can help after-school programs more effectively promote physical activity and prevent obesity among children.

Key Research Results

Children who attend after-school programs get some physical activity, but not enough.

- A study of 25 after-school programs in Omaha, NE, and Columbia, SC, found that the programs dedicated an average of 64 minutes of their daily schedule to opportunities for physical activity.¹¹ Among the programs, the time dedicated to physical activity ranged from 40 minutes to 120 minutes.
- Children accumulate 13 minutes to 24 minutes of moderate-to-vigorous physical activity each day at after-school programs.^{12, 13} This is less than half of the minimum national recommendation for physical activity.
- Two large-scale studies of 253 children attending three after-school programs¹² and 934 children attending 25 after-school programs¹¹ found, on average, children accumulated 2,800 to 2,900 steps per day during the after-school program. This is less than one-third of the daily recommendation for children, which is 10,000 to 13,000 steps per day.¹⁴
- A systematic observation of 745 children in 12 after-school programs indicated that only half of the children were physically active during the observation periods.¹⁵
- Based on current practice, the total length of an after-school program and the amount of time allocated in the program's schedule for physical activity do not appear to be related to the amount of time children spend in physical activity during the program.¹¹ However, when after-school programs reduce the amount of time dedicated to physical activity, children accumulate less physical activity.¹⁶ Conversely, incorporating physical activity into an after-school program's daily routine can lead to increased physical activity among children.¹⁷

Girls

Boys



FIGURE 1. Time Spent in Moderate-to-Vigorous Physical Activity During After-School Programs in Nebraska and South Carolina¹⁸

Note: Data represent 771 children attending 18 after-school programs in Nebraska and South Carolina. Children had to attend the after-school program a minimum of 60 minutes to be included in the estimates. Children wore ActiGraph accerlerometers up to four consecutive days; estimates use the Evenson et al., 2008 cutpoints.¹⁹

Physical activity policies in after-school programs vary.

- A comprehensive review identified national organizations and 14 states that have developed or adopted policies targeting physical activity within the after-school program setting.⁹ Some of these policies included general language, such as "provide scheduled daily play time," while other policies were highly specific: "20 percent of daily program time for moderate-to-vigorous physical activity" or "accumulate 30 minutes to 60 minutes of moderate-to-vigorous physical activity daily within the after-school program."
- The majority of existing policies regarding physical activity for after-school programs claim to be evidence-based, yet none of the evidence cited was based on data collected within the after-school program environment.⁹
- None of the policies regarding physical activity for after-school programs specified how compliance via state, national oversight organizations, national licensing agencies, or selfevaluation by after-school program leaders and staff will be conducted.
- A study¹² of 253 children ages 5 to 13 found that, depending on the policy, the percentage of children who met policy goals each day they attended an after-school program ranged from 0.1 percent for a specific goal (e.g., accumulate 60 minutes of physical activity daily) to 93 percent for a weak goal (e.g., provide opportunity for 30 minutes of physical activity every three hours).
- The largest study¹¹ of physical activity within after-school programs found that only 17 percent of children accumulated at least 4,600 steps per day while attending an after-school program. The study included daily observations of 934 children ages 4 to 14 at 25 after-school programs in South Carolina and Nebraska. The guideline for daily steps was developed to reflect California's policy which states that children should accumulate at least 30 minutes of moderate-to-vigorous physical activity each day while attending an after-school program.²⁰

Strategies to increase physical activity among children in after-school programs vary and evaluations of the programs are needed.

- There are more than 52 physical activity programs that after-school programs can purchase.²¹ It is unclear how many of the physical activity programs have been evaluated for effectiveness.
- Evaluations of commercial programs, such as the Sports, Play, and Active Recreation for Kids (SPARK) Afterschool Program and the Child and Adolescent Trial for Cardiovascular Health (CATCH) Kids Club, suggest they have limited effectiveness at increasing physical activity among children compared with after-school programs that do not have a commercial program.^{15, 22, 23}
- A comprehensive review⁵ of 13 physical activity interventions conducted across numerous afterschool programs found that the amount of time children spent in physical activity during the afterschool program increased by as much as 17 percent after the interventions were implemented.
- The effectiveness of programs designed to increase children's physical activity within after-school programs is mixed; some programs have decreased the amount of time children spend in moderate-to-vigorous physical activity and others have shown modest increases.^{13, 14, 22, 23}
- One study¹⁷ found modest increases (of up to 10 minutes per day) in the total daily amount of time children spent in moderate-to-vigorous physical activity. This was achieved by allocating time for physical activity, involving staff in activities or making other changes to better support physical activity in after-school programs.
- A review of some strategies suggests that after-school programs should enhance professional development training for their staff and offer such trainings at multiple times throughout the year to help children be more active during after-school programs.⁶
- No studies have evaluated whether interventions that aim to increase children's physical activity in after-school programs effectively help meet goals for physical activity that are specified within existing policies.

Conclusions

After-school programs have the potential to help children accumulate up to 30 minutes of moderate-to-vigorous physical activity each day, which would satisfy half of the national recommendation for daily physical activity. Such a goal is a reasonable expectation based on the amount of time after-school programs typically allocate for physical activity. Yet more efforts are needed to better support physical activity in the after-school setting.

Although 14 states have adopted physical activity policies for after-school programs and recent national standards for physical activity have been developed,¹⁰ there is little evidence showing that after-school programs facilitate sufficient amounts of physical activity to meet policy goals. In addition, the majority of polices, including those recently developed, fail to clearly define how to measure progress toward meeting the goals. Finally, no studies have specifically evaluated strategies for increasing physical activity in after-school programs to determine if they are helping to meet one or more of the established state-level policies.

page 5

Policy Implications

The evidence suggests that after-school programs can meaningfully contribute to children's overall daily physical activity, but their potential impact is far from being realized. Public health officials and after-school program leaders should strive to increase the amount of physical activity children accumulate while attending after-school programs.

- Policies for promoting physical activity in after-school programs need to be S.M.A.R.T. The policies should specifically target an important outcome (e.g., children accumulate 30 minutes of moderate-to-vigorous physical activity). The outcome needs to be measureable by oversight and licensing agencies, as well as after-school program leaders and staff. There should be a clearly defined accountability system in place to reward those that attain policy goals (e.g., a star rating system to indicate high levels of compliance) and support those in need of additional assistance (e.g., technical support, professional development training of after-school program staff). The outcome should be realistic and able to be achieved within a well-defined timeframe.
- Policies should state the amount of time scheduled for physical activity opportunities and the amount of physical activity children should accumulate each day they attend the program. Because children are intermittently active, scheduled time for physical activity needs to be at least two or three times more than the expected levels of physical activity. For example, if the goal is for children to accumulate 30 minutes of moderate-to-vigorous physical activity, the after-school program should schedule 60 minutes to 90 minutes of time for physical activity.
- Several aspects of the after-school program environment should be considered as interventions for supporting physical activity are developed. For example, promising strategies include maximizing the amount of time children spend in physical activity within the period of time already allocated for activity; refining existing evidence-based curricula to improve its effectiveness at increasing physical activity; ensuring that activities appeal to boys and girls; improving indoor and/or outdoor play space and the availability of play equipment; and creating effective professional development trainings to help after-school program staff better promote physical activity.²⁴
- Low-cost and scalable strategies, such as those previously described, need to be evaluated to determine if they contribute to meeting physical activity policy goals.
- Feasible and low-cost methods for assessing physical activity during after-school programs should be validated in research, then used to monitor adherence to policy goals.²⁰

This brief was prepared by Michael W. Beets, Assistant Professor, Arnold School of Public Health, University of South Carolina, with support from the Active Living Research staff. Peer review was provided by David A. Dzewaltowski, PhD, Kansas State University and Russell Pate, PhD, Arnold School of Public Health, University of South Carolina.

For updates and a Web-based version of this brief, visit www.activelivingresearch.org.

Active Living Research, a national program of the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, stimulates and supports research to identify environmental factors and policies that influence physical activity for children and families to inform effective childhood obesity prevention strategies, particularly in low-income and racial/ethnic communities at highest risk. Active Living Research wants solid research to be part of the public debate about active living.

Active Living Research

University of California, San Diego 3900 Fifth Avenue, Suite 310 San Diego, CA 92103-3138 www.activelivingresearch.org

Endnotes

- ¹ Ogden CL, Carroll MD, Curtin LR, Lamb MM, Flegal KM. Prevalence of high body mass index in US children and adolescents, 2007–2008. *JAMA*. Jan 20 2010; 303(3): 242–249.
- ² The Surgeon General's Call to Action to Decrease Overweight and Obesity 2001. Rockville, MD: United States Department of Health and Human Services, Public Health Service, Office of the Surgeon General, 2001.
- ³ Trost SG. Active Education: Physical Education, Physical Activity and Academic Performance. A Research Brief. Princeton, NJ: Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, 2009.
- ⁴ Pate RR, O'Neill JR. After-school interventions to increase physical activity among youth. *Br J Sports Med.* Jan 2009; 43(1): 14–18.
- ⁵ Beets MW, Beighle A, Erwin HE, Huberty J. Impact of After-School Programs to Increase Physical Activity—A meta-analysis. *Am J Prev Med.* 2009; 36(6): 527–537.
- ⁶ Beets MW. Enhancing the translation of physical activity interventions in afterschool programs. *American Journal of Lifestyle Medicine*. 2012 epub; first published on January 31, 2012 as doi:10.1177/1559827611433547.
- ⁷ Beets MW, Webster C, Saunders R, Huberty JL. Translating policies into practice: A framework for addressing childhood obesity in afterschool programs. *Health Promotion Practice*. (Available from author upon request.)
- ⁸ America After 3 PM. America After 3 PM: A Household Survey on Afterschool in America. 2009; www.afterschoolalliance.org/publications. cfm. Accessed 2009, March 2nd.
- ⁹ Beets MW, Wallner M, Beighle A. Defining standards and policies for promoting physical activity in afterschool programs. *J Sch Health*. 2010; 80(8): 411–417.
- ¹⁰ Wiecha JL, Gannett L, Hall G, Roth BA. National Afterschool Association Standards for Healthy Eating and Physical Activity in Out-Of-School Time Programs. 2011; www.niost.org. Accessed August 8th, 2011.
- ¹¹ Beets MW, Huberty JL, Beighle A. Physical activity of children attending afterschool programs: Research- and practice-based implications. *Am J Prev Med.* Feb 2012;42(2): 180–184.
- ¹² Beets MW, Rooney L, Tilley F, Beighle A, Webster C. Evaluation of policies to promote physical activity in afterschool programs: are we meeting current benchmarks? *Prev Med.* Sep–Oct 2010; 51(3-4): 299–301.
- ¹³ Trost SG, Rosenkranz RR, Dzewaltowski D. Physical activity levels among children attending after-school programs. *Med Sci Sports Exerc.* Apr 2008; 40(4): 622–629.

- ¹⁴ Tudor-Locke C, Craig CL, Beets MW, et al. How Many Steps/Day are Enough? For Children and Adolescents. *Int J Behav Nutr Phys Act.* Jul 28 2011; 8(1): 78.
- ¹⁵ Sharpe EK, Forrester S, Mandigo J. Engaging Community Providers to Create More Active After-School Environments: Results From the Ontario CATCH Kids Club Implementation Project. *J Phys Act Health*. Jan 2011; 8 Suppl 1: S26-31.
- ¹⁶ Dzewaltowski DA, Rosenkranz RR, Geller KS, et al. HOP'N after-school project: an obesity prevention randomized controlled trial. *Int J Behav Nutr Phys Act.* Dec 13 2010; 7(1): 90.
- ¹⁷ Gortmaker SL, Lee RM, Mozaffarian RS, et al. Impact of an After-school Intervention on Increases in Children's Physical Activity. *Med Sci Sports Exerc.* Aug 1 2011 epub.
- ¹⁸ Beets MW, Huberty J. unpublished data.
- ¹⁹ Evenson KR, Catellier DJ, Gill K, Ondrak KS, McMurray RG. Calibration of two objective measures of physical activity for children. *J Sports Sci.* Dec 2008; 26(14): 1557–1565.
- ²⁰ Beets MW, Beighle A, Bottai M, Rooney L, Tilley F. Pedometerdetermined step count guidelines for afterschool programs. *Journal of Physical Activity and Health.* 2012; 9(1): 71–77.
- ²¹ Hall G, Gruber D. Healthy Choices Afterschool: Investigation of the Alignment of Physical Activity and Nutrition Programs/Curricula and the National Afterschool Association Program Standards. New York: Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, The After School Project; 2006.
- ²² Nigg C, Battista J, Chang JA, Yamashita M, Chung R. Physical activity outcomes of a pilot intervention using SPARK active recreation in elementary after-school programs. *Journal of Sport & Exercise Psychology.* Jun 2004; 26: S144–S145.
- ²³ Kelder S, Hoelscher DM, Barroso CS, Walker JL, Cribb P, Hu S. The CATCH Kids Club: a pilot after-school study for improving elementary students' nutrition and physical activity. *Public Health Nutrition*. 2005; 8(2): 133–140.
- ²⁴ Weaver RG, Beets MW, Webster C, Beighle A, Huberty JL. A conceptual model for training afterschool program staffers to promote physical activity and nutrition. *J Sch Health*. Apr 2012; 82(4): 186–195.